

22-004937-NZ FILED IN MY OFFICE Cathy M. Garrett WAYNE COUNTY CLERK 3/10/2023 11:23 PM Linda Woods

**STATE OF MICHIGAN  
IN THE CIRCUIT COURT FOR THE COUNTY OF WAYNE**

**ABDUR CHOWDHURY, ANGELA DENHAM,**

On behalf of all others similarly situated,

Plaintiffs,

v.

Case No. 22-004937-NZ  
Hon. Edward Ewell, Jr.

**CITY OF HAMTRAMCK,**

Defendant.

---

**DUBIN LAW, PLLC**  
By: David R. Dubin (P52521)  
Attorney for Plaintiffs  
2723 S. State Street, Suite 150  
Ann Arbor, Michigan 48104  
(734) 821-9279  
[David.Dubin@DubinLawPLLC.com](mailto:David.Dubin@DubinLawPLLC.com)

**SCHEMK & BRUETSCH PLC**  
By: James P. Allen, Sr. (P52885)  
Attorneys for Defendant  
211 W. Fort St.  
Suite 1410  
Detroit, MI 48226  
(313) 774-1000  
[james.allen@sbdetroit.com](mailto:james.allen@sbdetroit.com)

---

**ORDER PRELIMINARILY APPROVING CLASS ACTION SETTLEMENT,  
APPROVING PROCEDURE AND FORM OF NOTICE AND  
SCHEDULING FINAL FAIRNESS HEARING**

At a session of said Court held in the County of  
Wayne, City of Detroit, State of Michigan, on

3/10/2023

PRESENT: Edward Ewell  
Circuit Court Judge

This matter having come before the Court on Plaintiffs' Motion for Preliminary Approval of Class Action Settlement ("Motion"), as set forth in the Settlement Agreement, due and adequate notice having been given, and the Court having fully considered the briefs and being duly advised in the premises and good cause appearing therefore, the Court hereby grants the Motion as set forth

in this Order Preliminarily Approving Class Action Settlement, Approving Procedure and Form of Notice and Scheduling Final Fairness Hearing (“Order”). Terms and phrases in this Order shall have the same meaning as in the Settlement Agreement.

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED:

1. The Court has jurisdiction over the parties to, and the subject matter of, the Actions.
2. The Court has reviewed the Settlement Agreement and the files, records, and proceedings to date in the Action. The Court finds that: (a) the Settlement Agreement is within the range of possible final approval as fair, reasonable, and adequate; (b) the Settlement Agreement is the result of arms-length negotiations between experienced attorneys familiar with the legal and factual issues of the Actions; (c) all Class Members appear to have been treated fairly under the Settlement Agreement; and (d) the Settlement Agreement is sufficient to warrant Notice thereof to the Class and the final fairness hearing described below. Accordingly, the Motion is granted.
3. For purposes of settlement only, the Court conditionally certifies the Class pursuant to MCR 3.501. In accordance with the Settlement Agreement, the Class is certified for settlement purposes only, to be defined as any Person listed in Exhibit 1, who claims that a Written Notice of Claim regarding the claimed Sewage Disposal System Event occurring on or about June 25-26, 2021 that was served on Defendant.
4. In accordance with the Settlement Agreement, the Court sets forth the following subclasses for settlement purposes only and for no other purpose:

- a. “Subclass A” consists of those Class Members listed on Exhibit 2 to the Settlement Agreement who claim that a Written Notice of Claim regarding the claimed Sewage Disposal System Event occurring on or about June 25-26, 2021 was served on the Defendant and who had provided itemized values of their Real Property Damage, Personal Property Damage, and/or Out of Pocket Expense to Class Counsel prior to February 22, 2023.
- b. “Subclass B” consists of any Class Members listed on Exhibit 3, or otherwise disclosed during the course of the 2021 Action, who timely filed a Written Notice of Claim regarding the claimed Sewage Disposal System Event occurring on or about June 25-26, 2021 and whose Claimed Address is located within the City of Hamtramck and who had not provided itemized values of their Real Property Damage, Personal Property Damage, and/or Out of Pocket Expense to Class Counsel prior to February 22, 2023.

5. For settlement purposes only, the Court finds that there are questions of law or fact that are common to the Class that predominates over questions affecting only individual Class Members in that the claims in the Actions all relate to alleged design, construction, operation, and/or maintenance of sewer systems which allegedly caused the claimed Sewage Disposal System Event occurring on or about June 25-26, 2021. Moreover, the Parties have agreed to, among other things, a claims procedure that allows for a monetary distribution to Class Members who submit a timely and valid claim as more fully described in the Settlement Agreement. Thus, all members of the Settlement Class have a shared interest in this matter and in the approval of this Settlement.

6. For settlement purposes only, the Court finds that the claims of Abdur Chowdhury and Angela Denham are typical of the Class Members' claims and that they will fairly and adequately assert and protect the interests of the Class.

7. For settlement purposes only, the Court finds that Class Counsel is adequate to serve as Class Counsel.

8. For settlement purposes only, certification of the Class is superior to other available methods of adjudication in promoting the convenient administration of justice.

9. Accordingly, Abdur Chowdhury and Angela Denham are hereby appointed as Class Representatives; their counsel of record, David R. Dubin, Dubin Law, PLLC, is appointed as counsel for the Class.

10. The Court finds that Class Counsel shall cause to be submitted to Class Members via First Class Mail, the Long Form Notice, in the form attached as Exhibit 8 to the Settlement Agreement without material alteration, and Class Counsel shall cause to be submitted the Email Notice to Class Members who have previously submitted a valid email address to Class Counsel, in the form attached as Exhibit 9 to the Settlement Agreement without material alteration. Class Counsel shall also cause the Long Form Notice along with copies of the Settlement Agreement, Claim Form-B to be posted on the website [www.DubinLawPLLC.com](http://www.DubinLawPLLC.com) The Court finds that the Notice Plan constitutes reasonable and the best practicable notice under the circumstances to members of the Settlement Class, and complies fully with the provisions set forth in MCR 3.501,

all substantive and procedural due process rights guaranteed by the United States Constitution, and any other applicable law. The Court also finds that the Notice Plan is reasonably calculated, under the circumstances, to apprise Class Members of the pendency of the Actions; the terms of the Settlement; their rights under the Settlement, including, but not limited to, the right to object to the Settlement, opt out of the Settlement, and/or receive a share of the Settlement Fund, and the procedure for doing so; and the date and location of the Final fairness hearing. Accordingly, the Notice and Notice Plan set forth in the Settlement Agreement are approved.

11. Consistent with the Settlement Agreement, including its Exhibit 5, no later than seven (7) days before the final fairness hearing, Class Counsel shall file with the Court one or more affidavits stating that, in accordance with the terms of this Order, Notice was distributed consistent with the terms and conditions of the Settlement Agreement including, but not limited to, the timing requirements applicable to Notice under the Settlement Agreement.

12. Any Class Member who wishes to be excluded from the Class must mail a written request for exclusion to Class Counsel at the address provided in the Notice. This request for exclusion must be postmarked no later than 45 days from the entry of this Order. The request to be excluded must be in writing and signed by the Class Member and must contain the following: the Class Member's full name, address and telephone number, and the Claimed Address; and must specifically contain a stated request for exclusion from the prospective Settlement Class and Settlement. They must also provide proof of identification by including a copy of any government-issued photo identification or an equivalent method of identification. Any Class Member's request for exclusion that does not meet these requirements is deemed invalid and ineffective, and the

Class Member will be considered included within the Settlement Class for purposes of the Settlement. Upon receipt of any exclusion request, the Class Counsel shall provide a copy of all such requests for exclusion to Defendant's Counsel promptly and contemporaneously. Any Class Member who chooses to be excluded from the Settlement as set forth in Section II.B. of the Settlement Agreement shall cease to be a Class Member upon the Court's approval of the Settlement. Any Class Member who chooses to be excluded from the Settlement shall be dismissed without prejudice from the Actions, as applicable, and without costs or attorney's fees to any party.

13. Any Class Member who chooses not to be excluded from the Settlement may register an objection to the Settlement Agreement and/or to the Class Counsel's motion for an award of attorney's fees, costs and expenses. Any Class Members desiring to object must file a notice of objection with the Court and serve a copy on Class Counsel and Defendant's Counsel no later than 45 days from the entry of this Order. Objections must be in writing and signed by the Class Member and must contain the following: the Class Member's full name, address and telephone number and the Claimed Address; and, must identify with reasonable particularity the basis for the objection and attach all documentation they intend to present to the Court in support of its, his, or her position. The objection must be in the form of a declaration or be in the form of an affidavit duly signed under penalty of perjury before a notary public. If an objection is submitted by someone purporting to represent a Class Member, the objection must have attached sufficient documentation of the person's identity and legal authority to represent the Class Member or the objection is deemed invalid and ineffective. Objections that do not meet the requirements set forth above are deemed invalid and ineffective.

14. To be eligible to participate in the distribution of the Settlement Fund, a Class Member must submit a timely and valid Claim Form to Class Counsel as more fully described in the Settlement Agreement. The Claim Form must be postmarked no later than 60 days from the entry of this Order.

15. Papers in support of final approval of the Agreement and fee award, along with the response to any objections, shall be filed with the Court no later than seven (7) days before the final fairness hearing.

16. A final fairness hearing is set for this matter on May 5, 2023 at 10:00 am via Zoom.

17. Counsel are hereby authorized to use all reasonable procedures in connection with approval and administration of the Settlement that are not materially inconsistent with this Order or the Settlement Agreement, including making, without further approval of the Court, minor changes to the form or content of the Notice, and other exhibits that the Parties jointly agree are reasonable or necessary.

18. This Court expressly reserves the right to adjourn the final fairness hearing from time to time without further notice and to approve the Settlement Agreement at or after the final fairness hearing.

19. This is not a final order and does not close the Actions.

SO ORDERED:

/s/ Edward Ewell  
Honorable Edward Ewell, Jr.  
Wayne County Circuit Court Judge

Dated: March 10, 2023